

---

# Contents

---

<b>Preface</b> . . . . .	xi
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction and Challenges</b> . . . . .	1
1.1. What is argumentation? . . . . .	1
1.2. Argumentation and argument mining . . . . .	4
1.3. The origins of argumentation . . . . .	7
1.4. The argumentative discourse . . . . .	8
1.5. Contemporary trends . . . . .	10
<b>Chapter 2. The Structure of Argumentation</b> . . . . .	13
2.1. The argument–conclusion pair . . . . .	13
2.2. The elementary argumentative schema . . . . .	14
2.2.1. Toulmin’s argumentative model . . . . .	14
2.2.2. Some elaborations and refinements of Toulmin’s model . . . . .	17
2.2.3. The geometry of arguments . . . . .	18
2.3. Modeling agreement and disagreement . . . . .	20
2.3.1. Agreeing versus disagreeing . . . . .	20
2.3.2. The art of resolving divergences . . . . .	23
2.4. The structure of an argumentation: argumentation graphs . . . . .	25
2.5. The role of argument schemes in argumentation . . . . .	27
2.5.1. Argument schemes: main concepts . . . . .	27
2.5.2. A few simple illustrations . . . . .	28
2.5.3. Argument schemes based on analogy . . . . .	29
2.5.4. Argument schemes based on causality . . . . .	30
2.6. Relations between Toulmin’s model and argumentation schemes . . . . .	31
2.6.1. Warrants as a popular opinion . . . . .	32
2.6.2. Argument schemes based on rules, explanations or hypothesis . . . . .	34

---

2.6.3. Argument schemes based on multiple supports or attacks . . . . .	35
2.6.4. Causality and warrants . . . . .	37
<b>Chapter 3. The Linguistics of Argumentation . . . . .</b>	<b>39</b>
3.1. The structure of claims . . . . .	40
3.2. The linguistics of justifications . . . . .	45
3.3. Evaluating the strength of claims, justifications and arguments . . . . .	47
3.3.1. Strength factors within a proposition . . . . .	49
3.3.2. Structuring expressions of strength by semantic category . . . . .	51
3.3.3. A simple representation of strength when combining several factors . . . . .	52
3.3.4. Pragmatic factors of strength expression . . . . .	53
3.4. Rhetoric and argumentation . . . . .	59
3.4.1. Rhetoric and communication . . . . .	60
3.4.2. Logos: the art of reasoning and of constructing demonstrations . . . . .	61
3.4.3. Ethos: the orator profile . . . . .	62
3.4.4. Pathos: how to persuade an audience . . . . .	63
<b>Chapter 4. Advanced Features of Argumentation for Argument Mining . . . . .</b>	<b>65</b>
4.1. Managing incoherent claims and justifications . . . . .	65
4.1.1. The case of justifications supporting opposite claims . . . . .	66
4.1.2. The case of opposite justifications justifying the same claim . . . . .	67
4.2. Relating claims and justifications: the need for knowledge and reasoning . . . . .	67
4.2.1. Investigating relatedness via corpus analysis . . . . .	68
4.2.2. A corpus analysis of the knowledge involved . . . . .	69
4.2.3. Observation synthesis . . . . .	72
4.3. Argument synthesis in natural language . . . . .	74
4.3.1. Features of a synthesis . . . . .	75
4.3.2. Structure of an argumentation synthesis . . . . .	76
<b>Chapter 5. From Argumentation to Argument Mining . . . . .</b>	<b>79</b>
5.1. Some facets of argument mining . . . . .	79
5.2. Designing annotation guidelines: some methodological elements . . . . .	81
5.3. What results can be expected from an argument mining system? . . . . .	82
5.4. Architecture of an argument mining system . . . . .	83
5.5. The next chapters . . . . .	84

---

<b>Chapter 6. Annotation Frameworks and Principles of Argument Analysis</b> . . . . .	85
6.1. Principles of argument analysis . . . . .	86
6.1.1. Argumentative discourse units . . . . .	86
6.1.2. Conclusions and premises . . . . .	88
6.1.3. Warrants and backings . . . . .	89
6.1.4. Qualifiers . . . . .	89
6.1.5. Argument schemes . . . . .	90
6.1.6. Attack relations: rebuttals, refutations, undercutters . . . . .	90
6.1.7. Illocutionary forces, speech acts . . . . .	92
6.1.8. Argument relations . . . . .	93
6.1.9. Implicit argument components and tailored annotation frameworks . . . . .	95
6.2. Examples of argument analysis frameworks . . . . .	97
6.2.1. Rhetorical Structure Theory . . . . .	97
6.2.2. Toulmin’s model . . . . .	98
6.2.3. Inference Anchoring Theory . . . . .	99
6.2.4. Summary . . . . .	102
6.3. Guidelines for argument analysis . . . . .	103
6.3.1. Principles of annotation guidelines . . . . .	103
6.3.2. Inter-annotator agreements . . . . .	104
6.3.3. Interpretation of IAA measures . . . . .	105
6.3.4. Some examples of IAAs . . . . .	106
6.3.5. Summary . . . . .	107
6.4. Annotation tools . . . . .	108
6.4.1. Brat . . . . .	108
6.4.2. RST tool . . . . .	109
6.4.3. AGORA-net . . . . .	110
6.4.4. Araucaria . . . . .	110
6.4.5. Rationale . . . . .	111
6.4.6. OVA+ . . . . .	112
6.4.7. Summary . . . . .	113
6.5. Argument corpora . . . . .	114
6.5.1. COMARG . . . . .	115
6.5.2. A news editorial corpus . . . . .	115
6.5.3. THF Airport ArgMining corpus . . . . .	115
6.5.4. A Wikipedia articles corpus . . . . .	115
6.5.5. AraucariaDB . . . . .	115
6.5.6. An annotated essays corpus . . . . .	116
6.5.7. A written dialogs corpus . . . . .	116
6.5.8. A web discourse corpus . . . . .	116

---

6.5.9. Argument Interchange Format Database . . . . .	116
6.5.10. Summary . . . . .	117
6.6. Conclusion . . . . .	118
<b>Chapter 7. Argument Mining Applications and Systems . . . . .</b>	<b>119</b>
7.1. Application domains for argument mining . . . . .	119
7.1.1. Opinion analysis augmented by argument mining . . . . .	120
7.1.2. Summarization . . . . .	120
7.1.3. Essays . . . . .	120
7.1.4. Dialogues . . . . .	120
7.1.5. Scientific and news articles . . . . .	120
7.1.6. The web . . . . .	121
7.1.7. Legal field . . . . .	121
7.1.8. Medical field . . . . .	121
7.1.9. Education . . . . .	121
7.2. Principles of argument mining systems . . . . .	122
7.2.1. Argumentative discourse units detection . . . . .	123
7.2.2. Units labeling . . . . .	123
7.2.3. Argument structure detection . . . . .	124
7.2.4. Argument completion . . . . .	125
7.2.5. Argument structure representation . . . . .	125
7.3. Some existing systems for argument mining . . . . .	126
7.3.1. Automatic detection of rhetorical relations . . . . .	126
7.3.2. Argument zoning . . . . .	126
7.3.3. Stance detection . . . . .	127
7.3.4. Argument mining for persuasive essays . . . . .	127
7.3.5. Argument mining for web discourse . . . . .	127
7.3.6. Argument mining for social media . . . . .	128
7.3.7. Argument scheme classification and enthymemes reconstruction . . . . .	128
7.3.8. Argument classes and argument strength classification . . . . .	128
7.3.9. Textcoop . . . . .	129
7.3.10. IBM debating technologies . . . . .	129
7.3.11. Argument mining for legal texts . . . . .	129
7.4. Efficiency and limitations of existing argument mining systems . . . . .	130
7.5. Conclusion . . . . .	131
<b>Chapter 8. A Computational Model and a Simple Grammar-Based Implementation . . . . .</b>	<b>133</b>
8.1. Identification of argumentative units . . . . .	134
8.1.1. Challenges raised by the identification of argumentative units . . . . .	134
8.1.2. Some linguistic techniques to identify ADUs . . . . .	135

---

8.2. Mining for claims . . . . .	139
8.2.1. The grammar formalisms . . . . .	140
8.2.2. Lexical issues . . . . .	142
8.2.3. Grammatical issues . . . . .	145
8.2.4. Templates for claim analysis . . . . .	148
8.3. Mining for supports and attacks . . . . .	150
8.3.1. Structures introduced by connectors . . . . .	150
8.3.2. Structures introduced by propositional attitudes . . . . .	151
8.3.3. Other linguistic forms to express supports or attacks . . . . .	152
8.4. Evaluating strength . . . . .	153
8.5. Epilogue . . . . .	154
<b>Chapter 9. Non-Verbal Dimensions of Argumentation: a Challenge for Argument Mining . . . . .</b>	<b>155</b>
9.1. The text and its additions . . . . .	156
9.1.1. Text, pictures and icons . . . . .	156
9.1.2. Transcriptions of oral debates . . . . .	156
9.2. Argumentation and visual aspects . . . . .	157
9.3. Argumentation and sound aspects . . . . .	158
9.3.1. Music and rationality . . . . .	159
9.3.2. Main features of musical structure: musical knowledge representation . . . . .	160
9.4. Impact of non-verbal aspects on argument strength and on argument schemes . . . . .	161
9.5. Ethical aspects . . . . .	162
<b>Bibliography . . . . .</b>	<b>163</b>
<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>175</b>